

**CASE DISCUSSION
OF KELSEY HANLON'S
"SARAH"**

**MARTHA STARK MD
MarthaStarkMD @ HMS.Harvard.edu**

**Friday Afternoon, April 22, 2022
IPI's Weekend Conference**

© 2022 Martha Stark MD

1

**"I GAVE YOU A PART OF ME
THAT I KNEW YOU COULD BREAK ...
... BUT YOU DIDN'T"**

ANONYMOUS QUOTE

2

**THE TRANSFORMATIVE "IN – BETWEEN"
"A MEETING GROUND
OF POTENTIALITY AND AUTHENTICITY"**

LAURA PRAGLIN

**"MOMENTS OF AUTHENTIC
AND HEARTFELT MEETING"**

**"I'LL PLANT A ROW OF DAISY SEEDS
IN THE SPACE BENEATH EACH OF YOUR EYES
SO THEY'LL REMIND YOU OF YOUR BEAUTY
WHEN THEY BLOOM EACH TIME YOU CRY"**

ERIN HANSON

3

**AN "OPTIMALLY STRESSFUL" INTERVENTION
– ONE THAT BOTH "CHALLENGES" AND "SUPPORTS" –
– ONE THAT BOTH "FRIGHTENS" AND "REASSURES" –**

**"SELF – ORGANIZING (CHAOTIC) SYSTEMS
RESIST PERTURBATION"**

CHARLES KREBS

**DYSFUNCTIONAL RELATIONAL DYNAMICS
MUST BE "STRESSED" ENOUGH
THAT THERE WILL BE "PROVOCATION" FOR CHANGE**

**MY PSYCHODYNAMIC SYNERGY PARADIGM (PSP)
FEATURES 5 DIFFERENT APPROACHES TO "HEALING"
MUTUALLY ENHANCING (NOT MUTUALLY EXCLUSIVE)**

4

MODEL 1
THE INTERPRETIVE PERSPECTIVE
OF CLASSICAL PSYCHOANALYTIC THEORY
“STRUCTURAL CONFLICT” / “NEUROTIC CONFLICTEDNESS”

MODEL 2
THE CORRECTIVE – PROVISION PERSPECTIVE
OF SELF PSYCHOLOGY
“STRUCTURAL DEFICIT” / “NARCISSISTIC VULNERABILITY”

MODEL 3
THE INTERSUBJECTIVE PERSPECTIVE
OF CONTEMPORARY RELATIONAL THEORY
“RELATIONAL CONFLICT” / “NOXIOUS RELATEDNESS”

MODEL 4
AN EXISTENTIAL – HUMANISTIC APPROACH
TO MENDING BROKENNESS
“RELATIONAL DEFICIT” / “NONRELATEDNESS”

5

“THERAPEUTIC ACTION”
ADVANCING THE PATIENT FROM
RIGID DEFENSE TO MORE FLEXIBLE ADAPTATION

MODEL 1
FROM “RESISTANCE” TO “AWARENESS”

MODEL 2
FROM “RELENTLESS HOPE” TO “ACCEPTANCE”

MODEL 3
FROM “RE – ENACTMENT” TO “ACCOUNTABILITY”

MODEL 4
FROM “RELATIONAL ABSENCE”
TO “AUTHENTIC PRESENCE”
FROM “RETREAT” TO “ACCESSIBILITY”

6

THERE ARE PATIENTS WHO,
NEVER HAVING FULLY CONFRONTED
– AND GRIEVED –
THE PAIN OF THEIR EARLY – ON HEARTBREAK,
WILL CLING TENACIOUSLY
TO THEIR HOPE
THAT PERHAPS SOMEDAY
THE “OBJECT OF THEIR DESIRE”
WILL BE FORTHCOMING

BUT THERE ARE OTHERS WHO,
IN THE AFTERMATH OF THEIR EARLY – ON HEARTBREAK,
WILL FIND THEMSELVES
WITHDRAWING COMPLETELY
FROM THE “WORLD OF OBJECTS”
– THEIR HEARTS SHATTERED –

7

PSYCHIC RETREAT
SCHIZOID WITHDRAWAL
EMOTIONAL DETACHMENT

ONLY THEN TO FIND THEMSELVES
OVERWHELMED BY INTENSE FEELINGS
OF ISOLATION, ALIENATION, AND DESPAIR

THE COMPETENT, ACCOMPLISHED,
CHEERFUL, COMPLIANT “MASK”
THEY PRESENT TO OTHERS
BELYING THE TRUTH THAT LIES HIDDEN WITHIN

NAMELY, THEIR DEVASTATING HEARTBREAK,
THEIR HARROWING LONELINESS,
AND THEIR PRIVATE PAIN

8

DONALD WINNICOTT
“FALSE SELF” vs “TRUE SELF”

9

AT A TIME WHEN IT IS AGE – APPROPRIATE
FOR THE INFANT TO HAVE A MOTHER UPON
WHOM SHE CAN “ABSOLUTELY DEPEND”

– AN “UNFALTERINGLY RELIABLE” MOTHER ABLE TO
“RECOGNIZE AND RESPOND TO” THE INFANT’S EVERY NEED –

THE MOTHER’S INABILITY TO
“MEET THE OMNIPOTENCE”
OF HER YOUNG CHILD WILL BE
“ABSOLUTELY ANNIHILATING”

AS A RESULT, THE NASCENT “TRUE SELF” OF THE INFANT
– THE POTENTIAL SOURCE OF SPONTANEITY AND CREATIVITY –

WILL GO INTO HIDING, REFUSING TO RISK
EXPOSING ITSELF WITHOUT BEING SEEN

ITS ESSENCE, THEREFORE, WILL REMAIN “INCOMMUNICADO”
ITS CORE UNRECOGNIZED, UNACKNOWLEDGED, UNDEVELOPED
DESPERATE TO BE KNOWN BUT TERRIFIED OF BEING FOUND
“IT IS A JOY TO BE HIDDEN AND A DISASTER NOT TO BE FOUND”¹⁰

WHAT THEN CRYSTALLIZES OUT WILL BE A "FALSE SELF"
A "PUBLIC (OR SOCIAL) SELF" THAT WILL GRADUALLY
BECOME EVER MORE ADEPT AT ACCOMMODATING ITSELF
- CHAMELEON - LIKE -
TO WHATEVER IT SENSES IS EXPECTED OF IT
- ALL THE WHILE KEEPING HIDDEN
THE UNDERLYING DESPAIR -
THE PERSON WILL LIVE, BUT THE EXISTENCE WILL BE
EMPTY, HOLLOW, SHALLOW, FALSE, AND DESPERATELY LONELY
IT WILL BE A LIE
ONE BASED ON "COMPLIANCE AND CONFORMITY"
- NOT ONE BASED ON AUTHENTICITY AND TRUTH -
THE PERSON WILL MAKE A SHOW OF BEING REAL
BUT IT WILL ONLY BE "AS IF" SHE IS ALIVE
BECAUSE HER LIFE WILL BE A SHAM,
A CHARADE, A PART SHE IS PLAYING,
A BORROWED IDENTITY ASSUMED FOR THE OCCASION

11

HARRY GUNTRIP
THE SCHIZOID PERSONALITY ATTEMPTS
TO CANCEL RELATIONSHIPS,
TO WANT NO ONE, AND TO MAKE NO DEMANDS
THE RESOLVE IS TO LIVE IN A DETACHED FASHION,
UNTOUCHED, WITHOUT FEELING, ALOOF,
KEEPING PEOPLE AT BAY, AVOIDING AT ALL COSTS
GENUINE COMMITMENT TO ANYONE
IT IS THE TERRIFYING FEAR OF "BEING ANNIHILATED"
BY THE OBJECT THAT DRIVES THE PATIENT
TO DETACH HERSELF COMPLETELY FROM
THE WORLD OF OBJECTS AND TO RENOUNCE ALL HOPE
BUT IT IS THE TERRIFYING FEAR OF "EGO DISSOLUTION"
- WHEN CONFRONTED WITH HOW UTTERLY ALONE SHE THEN FEELS -
THAT COMPELS HER TO REACH OUT
ONCE MORE FOR CONTACT

12

HARRY GUNTRIP

**GUNTRIP'S SCHIZOID IS CAUGHT
IN THE THROES OF A TERRIBLE
"NEED – FEAR / WISH – DREAD" DILEMMA**

**ON THE ONE HAND
SHE DESPERATELY NEEDS OBJECTS
BUT IS TERRIFIED
THAT SHE WILL BE DESTROYED BY THEM**

**ON THE OTHER HAND
SHE DESPERATELY NEEDS HER SOLITUDE
BUT IS TERRIFIED
THAT SHE WILL THEN DISAPPEAR**

**THE DILEMMA FOR MODEL 4 PATIENTS
IS HOW TO BE "A PART OF THE WORLD"
WITHOUT FEELING TOTALLY "EXPOSED AND ASHAMED"
BUT HOW TO BE "APART FROM THE WORLD"
WITHOUT DYING FROM THE "LONELINESS" OF IT ALL**

13

**I AM HERE REMINDED OF AN EVOCATIVE QUOTE
FROM LOUISE ERDRICH (2019)**

**"LIFE WILL BREAK YOU. NOBODY CAN PROTECT
YOU FROM THAT, AND LIVING ALONE WON'T EITHER,
FOR SOLITUDE WILL ALSO BREAK YOU WITH
ITS YEARNING. YOU HAVE TO LOVE. YOU HAVE
TO FEEL. IT IS THE REASON YOU ARE HERE
ON EARTH. YOU ARE HERE TO RISK YOUR HEART.
YOU ARE HERE TO BE SWALLOWED UP.
AND WHEN IT HAPPENS THAT YOU ARE BROKEN,
OR BETRAYED, OR LEFT, OR HURT, OR DEATH
BRUSHES NEAR, LET YOURSELF SIT BY AN
APPLE TREE AND LISTEN TO THE APPLES
FALLING ALL AROUND YOU IN HEAPS,
WASTING THEIR SWEETNESS. TELL YOURSELF
YOU TASTED AS MANY AS YOU COULD."**

14

ARNOLD MODELL

ALSO GERMANE FOR UNDERSTANDING
MODEL 4 PATIENTS IS MODELL'S BEAUTIFULLY
NUANCED DESCRIPTION OF PATIENTS WHO HAVE
"PSYCHICALLY RETREATED" FROM THE WORLD
OF OBJECTS IN ORDER TO PROTECT THE
"COHESIVENESS OF A PRECARIOUSLY ESTABLISHED SELF"
FROM BEING "SHATTERED" BY AN "INTOLERABLY
UNEMPATHIC RESPONSE" FROM THE OBJECT
MODELL SUGGESTS THAT TO AVOID POTENTIAL
"DISSOLUTION OF THE INTEGRITY" OF A "FRAGILE SELF,"
SUCH PATIENTS WILL ASSUME
A STANCE OF "SELF - PROTECTIVE ISOLATION" -
- A DEFENSIVE POSTURE SUPPORTED BY
"DENIAL OF OBJECT NEED" AND
"ILLUSIONS OF GRANDIOSE SELF - SUFFICIENCY"

15

EVER APPRECIATING THAT THERE IS AT LEAST
A PART OF THE PATIENT THAT LONGS TO BE SEEN,
THE THERAPIST MUST USE HER "INTUITION"
TO DECIDE WHETHER, IN THE MOMENT,
THE PATIENT IS WANTING TO BE FOUND
OR NEEDING, AT LEAST FOR THE TIME BEING,
TO REMAIN HIDDEN, NOT KNOWN, NOT SEEN

16

**WINICOTT'S
OBJECTIVE AND SUBJECTIVE
COUNTERTRANSFERENCE**

**OBJECTIVE COUNTERTRANSFERENCE
PRIMARILY A STORY ABOUT
THE HERE – AND – NOW
OF THE THERAPEUTIC ENGAGEMENT
AND, THEREFORE, THE PATIENT'S CONTRIBUTION
TO WHAT THE THERAPIST IS EXPERIENCING**

**SUBJECTIVE COUNTERTRANSFERENCE
PRIMARILY A STORY ABOUT
THE THERE – AND – THEN
OF THE THERAPIST
AND, THEREFORE, THE THERAPIST'S CONTRIBUTION
TO WHAT THE THERAPIST IS EXPERIENCING**

17

**MASUD KHAN
THE "PRIVACY OF THE SELF"**

**IN A BRILLIANT 1972 PAPER PUBLISHED IN THE
*INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF PSYCHOANALYSIS***

**KHAN WRITES ABOUT THE IMPORTANCE
OF GIVING PATIENTS WHO HAVE
EMOTIONALLY WITHDRAWN FROM THE
WORLD OF OBJECTS AN OPPORTUNITY
TO OVERCOME THEIR
"DREAD OF SURRENDER
TO RESOURCELESS DEPENDENCE"
ON THE THERAPIST**

18

**“MY ICE IS THIN YOU KNOW
SO I’M TOO SCARED TO LET WARMTH IN
BECAUSE IT’S OH SO DARK BELOW
AND I DON’T KNOW HOW TO SWIM”**

ERIN HANSON

19

**KHAN HIGHLIGHTS THAT
– EQUALLY IMPORTANTLY –
THE THERAPIST AS WELL
MUST BE ABLE TO OVERCOME**

***HER* “DREAD OF SURRENDER
TO THE THERAPEUTIC PROCESS,”**

**HER OWN HESITATION ABOUT BRINGING HER
AUTHENTIC SELF INTO THE TREATMENT ROOM,
AND HER OWN ANXIETIES ABOUT LETTING
HERSELF BE CONTROLLED BY THE PATIENT**

**IF THERE IS EVER TO BE HOPE THAT
THE PATIENT, IN HER TURN, WILL BE
ABLE EVENTUALLY TO OVERCOME
HER “DREAD OF SURRENDER TO
INFANTILE DEPENDENCE” ON ANOTHER**

20

MICHAEL BALINT (1959)
THE THERAPEUTIC VALUE OF
“BENIGN REGRESSION TO DEPENDENCE”
FOR THOSE PATIENTS WHO HAVE DEVELOPED
A “BASIC FAULT” BECAUSE OF
“FAILURE IN THE EARLY – ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROVISION”
HE WRITES ELOQUENTLY ABOUT
THE IMPORTANCE OF ALLOWING FOR A
“HARMONIOUS INTERPENETRATING MIX – UP”
BETWEEN PATIENT AND THERAPIST
SUCH THAT – AT LEAST FOR A PERIODS OF TIME –
THE PATIENT CAN HAVE THE EXHILARATING EXPERIENCE
OF BEING PEACEFULLY MERGED WITH ANOTHER
THIS BLISSFUL STATE OF “PEACEFUL MERGER”
IS CRITICALLY IMPORTANT IF THE PATIENT’S
“AUTHENTIC SELF” IS EVER TO BE FOUND

21

WINNICOTT’S “PRIMARY ALONENESS”
“BEING ALONE IN THE PRESENCE OF”
IF THE INFANT IS LUCKY ENOUGH
TO HAVE HAD THE EXPERIENCE
OF BEING ALONE IN THE PRESENCE OF
A MOTHER UPON WHOM THE INFANT
COULD BE ABSOLUTELY DEPENDENT,
THEN LATER ON IN LIFE
THAT INDIVIDUAL WILL BE ABLE MORE EASILY
TO TOLERATE THE EXPERIENCE
OF BEING ALONE
THIS CAPACITY TO RELAX INTO
– AND EVEN ENJOY –
THE EXPERIENCE OF BEING ALONE IS PARADOXICAL
BECAUSE IT IS THE EXPERIENCE OF BEING ALONE
BUT WHEN A NONINTRUSIVE OTHER IS PRESENT
– WHETHER IN ACTUAL FACT OR SIMPLY IN THE MIND’S EYE –

22



23

**IF YOU WOULD
LIKE TO BE
ON MY MAILING LIST,
PLEASE EMAIL ME AT
MarthaStarkMD @
HMS.Harvard.edu**

24